

## AUTHOR:

Timothy Scarnecchia<sup>1</sup>

## AFFILIATION:

<sup>1</sup> Professor, Kent State University

## ORCID:

<https://orcid.org/0009-0003-8865-6310>

## EMAIL:

[tscarnec@kent.edu](mailto:tscarnec@kent.edu)

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.38140/sjch.v49i1.8571>

[org/10.38140/sjch.v49i1.8571](https://doi.org/10.38140/sjch.v49i1.8571)

ISSN 2415-0509 (Online)

Southern Journal for Contemporary History

2024 49(1):85-88

## PUBLISHED:

28 June 2024

---

---

## BOOK REVIEW

---

---

Marmon, Brooks. *Pan-Africanism Versus Partnership: African Decolonisation in Southern Rhodesian Politics, 1950-1963*. New York: Springer, 2023. SBN 10: 3031255585

Brooks Marmon's *Pan-Africanism versus Partnership* is a welcome addition to the historiography of Zimbabwe's political history. There has not been much written of late on this period, as most historians have focused on the liberation war and the negotiated settlement leading up to Zimbabwe's independence in 1980. Marmon has taken up the challenge of re-assessing the messiness of white settler and African nationalist politics during the 10-year Federation period (1953-1963). During this period, white politicians from Southern Rhodesia (Zimbabwe), Northern Rhodesia (Zambia) and Nyasaland (Malawi) tried to forestall African majority rule from reaching their territories by engineering a veneer of a more racially inclusive politics short of majority rule for the Federal government. Marmon does an excellent job of bringing to life the debates and power plays of various white politicians and parties as they tried to block the growth of "pan-Africanism" amongst the Black African movements in the Central African Federation (CAF). In addition to establishing how central the fear of black nationalism, or pan-Africanism, was to white politicians, Marmon demonstrates how important it was for fledgling Zimbabwean African politicians to navigate and build ties with pan-African movements in West, Central, and Southern Africa during this period.

Marmon is clear throughout the book that he is not interested in rehashing older tropes around the demise of white liberals in the Federation period. Instead, the focus is on how right-wing segregationists tried, in fits and starts, to push Southern Rhodesia in the direction it would eventually find itself by 1962 and certainly be the Unilateral Declaration of Independence period after 1965. Marmon's careful reading of speeches and debates amongst white politicians shows very clearly how right parties tried again and again to use the fear of pan-Africanism making its way into the Federation from the rest of the continent.

Marmon then demonstrates how right-wing parties were only really able to wrestle power from the more mainstream party, the United Federal Party (UFP), after the Congo European refugee crisis in 1960, which saw large numbers of white refugees flood into the CAF from the Congo. The assassination of Patrice Lumumba in 1961 also added to the immediacy of the situation, and this would lead to a major victory for the Rhodesian Front (RF) in 1962 because by then, as Marmon describes, a majority of white voters believed that the UFP was appeasing pan-Africanism. Marmon does an excellent job in the first two chapters mapping out this process, providing evidence from Rhodesian newspapers and US and UK government archives.

The related thread of Marmon's book is that African nationalist politicians in these early years were forced to quickly come to terms with the difficulties of external support for their parties. Marmon demonstrates how new parties needed to define their allegiances to different types of pan-African currents elsewhere in Africa. In turn, the many splits among the emerging Zimbabwean nationalist movements are shown to reflect the difficulties of aligning with one or another pan-African trend on the continent and in Southern and Central Africa. The main vehicle used to illustrate this point is the Zimbabwe National Party (ZNP), led by Paul Mashonga and Michael Mawema, which only managed to survive as a party from June 1961 to September 1962. The ZNP leaders, according to Marmon's research, attempted to make the correct links with West African and regional pan-African leaders, but in the end, they were squeezed out by the National Democratic Party (NDP), then under the leadership of Joshua Nkomo. Marmon carefully details the implications of the ZNP's association with different regional leaders, including Moise Tshombe of the secessionist Katanga province and Malawi's leader Hastings Banda. Such dealings turned out to ruin the ZNP's standing, even when the ZNP leaders had a progressive pan-African platform. This "sell-out" logic was brutal for those Zimbabwean nationalists who tried to escape the dominant party, the NDP.

After reading Part 1 of Marmon's book, I was intrigued by the argument that the behaviour and practices of white politicians and parties could have been influential in the formation of African politicians and movements in Southern Rhodesia. Chapter 3 does a very good job of both describing and analysing the influences of external pan-African support on the significant Zimbabwean nationalists in 1963. Marmon establishes how splits in the pan-African world, "emboldened criticisms of Nkomo's shortcomings, and which influenced the divisions". (p. 48). Marmon goes on to provide a valuable narrative of the ZANU-ZAPU (Zimbabwe African National Union- Zimbabwe African's Union) split that would set the stage for constant problems for Zimbabwe's liberation movements, both before and after Independence.

Part Two of the book sets out to demonstrate the importance of links to pan-African leaders and movements in the early 1960s, using examples of Ghana and Nigeria in West Africa, the Congo (Leopoldville), and then the pivotal role of Malawian nationalists. Marmon demonstrates the roles these diverse post-colonial governments and their leaders played in both offering models for Zimbabwean nationalists. At other times, these leaders intervened as powerbrokers, making alliances that had an oversized influence on the future of Zimbabwean nationalist parties. Marmon offers new insights into Kwame Nkrumah's views of Zimbabwean nationalists, with the interesting suggestion made that Nkrumah may have likely given his support to ZANU in the early 1960s because he felt he could exert greater control over ZANU than Joshua Nkomo's ZAPU. The chapter also examines the roles of Robert Mugabe's first wife, Sarah (Sally) Mugabe, who was Ghanaian, and Robert Mugabe's own formative experience as a teacher in independent Ghana. Chapter 4 also compares the role of white CAF politicians attempting to lobby in Lagos, Nigeria, for greater recognition of the CAF as "African" rather than a white-ruled settler federation. This little-known story offers insights into the lengths white politicians went to rebrand themselves as part of post-colonial Africa, even if such schemes ultimately failed. Chapter 5 explores the important links of events in the Congo, particularly the sudden influx of white refugees to the CAF in 1960 and then the way the news of Patrice Lumumba's assassination in 1961 impacted both white and black politics in Rhodesia. The influence of Moise Tshombe as leader of the secessionist Katanga state also had an important role in this period, and those Zimbabweans who met with Tshombe soon felt the sell-out wrath from other parties and factions. Marmon explores how the Congo crisis of 1960-62 helped to push the white electorate in Southern Rhodesia to vote out the UFP and support the RF.

In Chapter 6 Marmon provides some very interesting details on the relationships between Zimbabwean nationalists and the Nyasaland (Malawi) nationalists. The history of these relations tends to see the influence of Malawian nationalists as initially radicalising, and Marmon reinforces this view. He describes a speech by Hasting Banda in Southern Rhodesia that had a radicalising impact. However, Marmon shows how the “megalomaniac, H. K. Banda” (p. 154) also became a strong ally of the RF, as Winston Field, after winning the 1962 election, went to Malawi to meet President Banda on his first foreign trip (p. 176). Marmon also notes that ‘the first person ever deported from independent Malawi was the public Secretary for ZAPU’s Malawi office (p. 192).

This book offers a lot of new material for those interested in Zimbabwe’s political situation during the pivotal period of the late 1950s and early 1960s. Marmon’s use of right-wing white politics and the politics of the short-lived ZNP offers a new lens for understanding this period. There are some sections that become a bit too one-dimensional, including the section where Marmon describes the roles of three white Europeans who worked with the nationalists, including Peter MacKay, Guy Clutton Brock, and Terence Ranger. These sections did not, in my opinion, do justice to the roles of these white “outsiders”, but of course, as Marmon notes, they have been the subject of much writing in the past, along with works on Garfield Todd. The same observation, however, can be raised for most of the other individuals discussed in the book, as Marmon is not so concerned with providing biographical information as he is with describing the relationships between parties and movements. In this sense, Marmon’s careful attention to detail and extensive research from a diverse primary source base make up for the lack of character development. Political history does not require biography, or “great men’s history”, to make it work, and in that sense, Marmon’s approach recalls some of the best of political history written around the time period he has covered in this book. Marmon’s book also reminds us that African nationalist and political history does not always have to centre around those who survived the struggle to the end. The more we know about these earlier divisions and diverse political threads, the better off future generations will be in determining a useful and plausible history of the politics leading to the formation of modern Zimbabwe.